

TERRILL L. HILL
MAYOR - COMMISSIONER

MARY LAWSON BROWN
VICE MAYOR - COMMISSIONER

RUFUS J. BOROM
COMMISSIONER

JUSTIN R. CAMPBELL
COMMISSIONER

JAMES NORWOOD, JR.
COMMISSIONER



BETSY JORDAN DRIGGERS
CITY CLERK

MATTHEW D. REYNOLDS
FINANCE DIRECTOR

JAMES A. GRIFFITH
INTERIM CHIEF OF POLICE

MICHAEL LAMBERT
CHIEF FIRE DEPT

DONALD E. HOLMES
CITY ATTORNEY

Regular meeting 2nd and 4th Thursdays each month at 6:00 p.m.

MINUTES
CITY OF PALATKA WORKSHOP MEETING
April 23, 2015; 5:30 p.m.

Proceedings of a called workshop meeting of the City Commission of the City of Palatka, Florida, held on the 23rd day of April, 2015.

PRESENT: Mayor Terrill L. Hill
Commissioner Rufus Borom
Commissioner Justin Campbell
Commissioner James Norwood, Jr.

ABSENT: Commissioner Mary Lawson Brown

Also Present: Interim City Manager Allen R. Bush; City Attorney Donald E. Holmes; City Clerk Betsy Jordan Driggers; Finance Director Matt Reynolds; Interim Police Chief James Griffith; Fire Chief Mike Lambert; Water Treatment Plant Superintendent Melvin Register

1. **CALL TO ORDER/Reading of Workshop Meeting Call** – Mayor Hill called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m. and read the following meeting call, which was issued on March 24, 2015:

**TO COMMISSIONERS: MARY LAWSON BROWN, RUFUS BOROM,
JUSTIN CAMPBELL AND JAMES NORWOOD, Jr.:**

You are hereby notified that a Workshop Meeting is hereby called to be held on Thursday, April 23, 2015, commencing at 4:00 p.m. This called workshop will be held at the regular meeting place of the Palatka City Commission at Commission Chambers, 201 N. 2nd Street, Palatka.

The purpose of the Workshop is to discuss a request for community water fluoridation.

/s/ Terrill L. Hill
Terrill L. Hill, MAYOR

The following Commissioners acknowledged receipt of a copy of the foregoing notice of a workshop meeting on the 24th day of March, 2015.

/s/ Mary Lawson Brown
COMMISSIONER

/s/ Justin Campbell
COMMISSIONER

/s/ James Norwood, Jr.
COMMISSIONER

/s/ Rufus Borom
COMMISSIONER

INVOCATION & PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE – Commissioner Borom

- WORKSHOP TOPIC – Request to Fluoridate Community Water Supply** - Johnny Johnson, Jr., DMD, MS, Co-Chair, Fluoridation Action Team, Oral Health Florida; speaking at the request of Dr. Eric Jump and Mary Garcia, and on behalf of the Florida Dental Association, Oral Health Florida's Fluoridation Action Team, and as a private practice pediatric dentist; and Steve Chapman, DDS, Orthodontist – Dr. Johnson said he is a pediatric dentist from Pinellas County. He got involved in community fluoridation when their local Commission voted to stop fluoridating his community's water. Fluoridation is a prudent and safe mineral and there is no good basis in science to stop putting this in the water. Water fluoridation has been in the US for over 70 years. He speaks for the Florida Dental Association and its 7,000 members, and the Fluoridation Action Team. Cavities are a communicable disease and are spread from one person to the other. Cavities lead to a host of problems including school absences and adult attendance issues at work. It costs a lot of money to fix cavities and they can be life threatening. They are disproportionately distributed amongst the poor, who have no or little means to get regular dental care. Over 44% of Palatka residents live in poverty. In 2012 over \$400,000 was spent in hospital emergency room visits by Palatka residents on dental-related issues. This was not for dental treatment, but for antibiotics and pain pills. Dr. Johnson related an instance wherein a young man of 12 died from a cavity in a molar which became infected, saying kids and adults can die quickly.

Dr. Johnson said community water fluoridation reduces cavities by 25% above and beyond those using fluoridated toothpaste. It is safe and effective and provides huge cost savings, and reduces human pain and suffering. Everyone can drink fluoridated water without a single adverse health affect being shown in 70 years of fluoridated water. He knows people believe there are issues with it, but credible science does not bear that out. All people have to do is drink fluoridated water to get a 25% drop in cavities. Adults experience more benefits than children. For every dollar that is spent in water fluoridation, it creates a savings of \$38 per year in emergency dental treatment. Fluoridation will cost \$1.15 per person per year for citizens in Palatka. No widely respected health organization in the world opposes fluoridation. Every Surgeon General has endorsed it as safe and healthy to the body. When they start water fluoridation they will see a drop in cavities. When they stop fluoridation they will see an increase in cavities. A blue ribbon panel established by Congress evaluated information on water fluoridation. Recommendations reaffirmed community water fluoridation based upon strong evidence in effectiveness in reducing cavities across populations. There is no evidence that fluoridation causes severe fluorosis. Severe fluorosis does not occur in the US from fluoridated water. The National Academies said there are no health effects from fluoride in water at 2 mg/l. There are no health issues, except for the possibility of white lines, or mild dental fluorosis, on the teeth, which makes them more resistant to cavities. The choice is tooth decay or mild dental fluorosis. Water fluoridation is safe and effective and the most effective means used to reach everyone in the community. It benefits all members of the community. It offers a great return on investment at a cost of \$1.15 per person per year. It is recommended by the Task Force on Preventive Services as well as other medical professional associations. He asks the Commission to return water fluoridation to the community.

Dr. Johnson said he distributed applications for community water assistance from FDEP which covers fluoridation equipment. All of the City's water fluoridation equipment is gone. Mr. Isaacs with FDEP said the State will treat it as a start-up program, for which money is available for the equipment and for the additive for up to two years. This money is available starting in October.

Commissioner Norwood asked, after two years, what happens. Dr. Johnson said the community will be paying for the cost of fluoridation. They arrived at the \$1.15 cost based upon the number of citizens divided by \$12,000 per year. This does not take into consideration the cost of maintenance of fluoridation equipment.

Dr. Ron Baughman, 246 Crystal Cove Drive, said he is a professor in the field of pathology and has a dental degree. He specializes in head and neck pathology. He stated he circulated information on fluorodosis (not filed). He has lectured for many years on all types of world diseases. Diseases of the oral cavity can affect all organs of the body. Fluoriditis has been studied since 1901. In 1931 the company that was doing bauxite mining hired a chemist to look at why people in the community were getting brown spots on their teeth. The chemist found the water supply had excessive fluoride, which was causing the fluoridosis. Any chemical in excess is detrimental but when used in balance, they are very beneficial. Putnam is a poor county and many children are underserved for medical issues. Fluoridation can benefit children. It is not detrimental to health when used in the proper amount. It is beneficial to the populous. Science backs this up. Quality research has been done on this matter, which has been published in referee journals. In 1999 the CDC designated fluoridation as one of the 10 greatest public health achievements of the past century. He hopes they will look at this from a scientific viewpoint and not an emotional one.

Mayor Hill asked what they do when they find studies that fall just outside of the reliability standards. Dr. Baughman said as to studies in health, nothing is perfect, but the tremendous amount of data substantiates that this is a safe, beneficial practice. Mayor Hill asked if they give value to the data when they are outside of that standard. Dr. Baughman said all the research all tilts in one direction, which outweighs the other.

Mayor Hill asked what happens to the people who don't want fluoride in their water. Dr. Baughman said most bottled water and soft drinks contain fluoride. If citizens don't want fluoride in their water they can purchase bottled water. Children will get the benefit of fluoride when they are in school and most of the children in the County go to school in Palatka.

Dr. Johnson said as to removal of fluoride, a water utility's sole purpose is to deliver water to your tap. If you don't want it in your water, and it already occurs naturally in water, if it is adjusted to 0.7, the customer can buy a reverse osmosis filter which removes 87% of the fluoride in the water to a level that would be lower than what naturally occurs in the water.

Mary Garcia, Putnam County Health Department Administrator, said at the last meeting she asked the director of the Oral Division of Health for the CDC to put together a document discussing the evidence and data on the benefits of community water fluoridation. She shared Dr. Armstrong's policy statement on community water fluoridation, which shows that cities have embraced the concept of fluoridation in Florida. The CDC states it is one of the benefits recommended for controlling dental decay. There is overwhelming support from health care communities as the most economic means of controlling major dental problems in children.

Mayor Hill asked if the health department collected data on children's dental health before Palatka stopped fluoridating its water. She said they started a program in 2010 as this was becoming an issue in children. These programs are expensive. They have started with 2nd graders and have already seen children with deep abscesses. Dental pain accounts for many school absences. The program is a school based sealant program where the children get topical fluoride treatment and then they seal their molars, which helps delay cavities. If they need dental services they can refer for those. This is a brand new program begun in connection with the School Board in one school. They have a dental clinic in the school one day per week at no charge, or for whatever dental insurance will pay. Through this program they can see a large volume of kids. They are targeting 2nd graders and 6th graders, as they receive the most benefit through sealants.

Commissioner Norwood said, as to abscesses, if fluoride is in the water, will this stop abscesses in children? Mrs. Garcia said part of prevention is eating healthier as well and having better behaviors and improving economics. The fluoride seems to be protective and acts as a cavity

barrier. Dr. Baughman said the fluoride reduces the chances of getting abscesses, but does not eliminate the chances.

Dr. Eric Jump, DO, area Pediatrician, said dental cavities are one of the most chronic diseases in children. He has witnessed a horrific rise in tooth decay in needy children. The result of dental decay is a decrease in the quality of their lives and increases instance of disease. It is a given that children that should be at the top of our list and we should take care of their health. Children with painful, rotten teeth find it difficult to participate in school, sports and later on, in job searches. All reputable organizations report and continue to report the flaws in anti-fluoridation studies, which are based on conspiracy theories and other influences. A former commission voted to rescind the ordinance in place for community fluoridation. Not one public health representative was brought in at that meeting for consultation. It is not good to discount or ignore a community's health resources. The Commission only heard from one side. The decision was railroaded through by only one side. Many distractions will be presented to take them off-topic. He urges the commission to reinstate community fluoridation. The poor and most vulnerable will reap the most benefit.

3. OTHER PRESENTATIONS on behalf of citizens opposed to the request for fluoridation:

Jan Pettit, 418 Emmett Street on behalf of herself and others – Ms. Pettit said if the Commission wants copies of peer reviewed studies, if they will make note of the studies she will provide copies. She was very disappointed when she moved here and found Palatka fluoridating its water. She is a mother, former teacher and former Peace Corps volunteer. In her work with the Peace Corps, she never saw a child with a toothache (from the country she worked in outside the US). They didn't eat sugar or drink soft drinks. Cavities are rampant in the US, especially in African American children. If she thought fluoridation would stop tooth decay she would be on their side, but she does not believe it to be so. Fluoride doesn't work. Based on two Harvard studies, fluoride is detrimental to older women as it causes bones to be more brittle.

Ms. Pettit narrated a Power Point presentation. Her grandson Max was born with a genetic disease which she believes is caused by over-fluoridation. She looked on the internet to see how prevalent this disease is. It is more and more prevalent each year. No one on either side of her family had this disease. It came from something in the environment. He is now 11; since his birth the instance of children being born with this disease has increased from 1 in 300,000 to one in 3,000. As he matures he will develop small tumors on the end of his nerves. She showed a photo of twins, one with the disease and one without. The bumps can cause blindness and paralysis. They come on with puberty. When Max's baby teeth erupted they were black with severe dental fluorosis. They are strong, but like glass, break easily. They spent thousands of dollars having them all capped. Another of her grandchildren had his teeth erupt stained black, also with severe dental fluorosis. She believes this was all caused by community water fluoridation. Information she gleaned from the Internet says the bumps are created by protein cells that don't function normally. Protein forms particularly strong bonds with calcium and hydrogen. Fluoride is a halogen, along with chlorine and iodine. All protein is strings of beads held together by hydrogen atoms. DNA is also a protein of the double helix, also held in place with hydrogen bonding. Fluoride is a protein disturber, and it can cause birth defects. Written studies show instances of Down's syndrome is 30% higher in fluoridated areas. In fluoridated communities it is occurring in high numbers of births to women under 30.

Ms. Pettit said in over 90% of the cities fluoridating water, the fluoride is compounded with silicone, which is rated as extremely toxic. Sodium fluoride in toothpaste is very toxic; this is why the label says if it is swallowed you should call poison control. All water has some fluoride, but it is naturally occurring calcium fluoride and less than 2% is absorbed into the body. As to the fluoride used in fluoridation, over 40% of it is absorbed. It is not the same. Calcium fluoride is eliminated through the bowels; the other is absorbed into the system. She referred to a slide

concerning a study done by Dr. Roger Masters of Dartmouth showing if a child has high levels of lead in his/her system at age 7, he/she is apt to take part in violent crime as an adult. He obtained blood fluoride levels of children in 400 counties. In counties where fluoride was used, lead absorption was also higher. He determined fluoridated water causes absorption of lead in the brain and these communities create more violent criminals. All of her studies, some from the CDC, state none of their studies state fluoride is safe and effective. A book called "The Greatest Fraud: Fluoridation" was written by Dr. Phillip Sutton, a prominent Australian dentist. He collected all of the studies claimed by the fluoride Industry stating that fluoride prevents tooth decay. He found none of them were double-blinded and none pass scientific scrutiny.

Ms. Pettit said fluoride is called a protective medicine. Consumers must give their consent to be medicated. There is no study that states it is effective. She has offered a reward of thousands of dollars, which is still available, to anyone who can produce a study that states fluoridation is safe. No one has claimed the reward. She showed slides of line graphs produced during a physician's study showing that fluoride causes more human cancer deaths, and causes them faster, than any other source. A study that looked at instances after fluoridation begins shows the instance of cancer rises dramatically. They studied 20 cities with the same rate of cancer deaths, but when fluoridation begins, the lines split and instances increased in those fluoridated communities. This data was obtained from government records. Fourteen Nobel Prize winners in medicine and chemistry have expressed opposition to fluoridation. The Pasteur and Nobel institutes recommend against fluoridation. Europe is mostly un-fluoridated. A large study was done on communities by the Fluoride industry which was never published because it shows that fluoridation causes cavities and tooth decay. In 1997 the University of Arizona did a study that shows that the more fluoride a child drinks, the more cavities they have. Cavities are at epidemic levels in communities where the water is fluoridated. Research shows that fluoridation claims of benefit are fraudulent.

Other studies from around the world were shown. Ms. Pettit said economic levels are a better predictor of dental issues than fluoridation. All processed foods and soft drinks, produce and beer and wine are laced with fluoride, and especially vegetables, due to the pesticides. A coke and a glass of orange juice exceed the optimum fluoride levels. Fluoride is found to erode pipes. Fluoride corrodes everything. The City's building that housed the fluoride equipment is completely corroded. It's an unnecessary expense for cities. School children's tooth decay was reduced by 90% by giving them xyletol gum and mints. It is a natural tooth decay barrier. Fluoridation was never about protecting children's teeth. Florida produces 70% of all of the fluoride chemical in the US in Bartow. They have fertilizer companies there. It is a byproduct of phosphate mining. The EPA stopped them from mining because it was killing the cattle and orange trees. The fluoride is a by-product of cleaning the phosphate. If they can't sell it to cities, there is no place they can put it. The EPA won't allow them to dump it in any water system, including the ocean. It is so reactive it will eat through metal and glass and plastic. It is also radioactive. When you take in fluoride, 50 – 60 percent stays in your body. It will cost around \$60 - \$80 thousand to dump it, so selling it to cities will turn them a profit. They pay dentists to promote fluoridation. Dentists make more money in fluoridated areas than they do in non-fluoridated areas. A doctor in Canada who teaches at the largest dental school in Canada told her he spends more time dealing with fluoridated teeth than fixing cavities. He used to promote fluoridation but now he fights fluoridation. Ten years ago he issued an apology to his students and faculty for unintentionally misleading them on the safety of fluoride, as it is, in his opinion, quite toxic. A class action suit filed against cities for fluoridating their water supply is just waiting to happen. This doctor said cities have been dumping this toxic byproduct into water supplies and exposing innocent, unsuspecting people to many toxic carcinogens. The affect on health is catastrophic. A study was done on hip replacements and found those patients have double the fluoride in their bones compared to areas that aren't fluoridated. This area is fraught with fraud.

She spoke of a doctor that was a top toxicologist who used a very sophisticated system to test the results of fluoride on rats. The mother rat gestated it and it affected brain development in the mother and babies. When given to baby rats, the affect was even greater. This doctor published her results and was blackballed by the ADA and now cannot get a grant. Her studies show fluoridation is "dumbing down children." The CDC has now stated that 41% of young teenagers in the country have fluoridoses, 60% of white children, 80% of black children. Andrew Young, a former Mayor of Atlanta and very prestigious civil rights leader, is trying to get fluoride out of Georgia. He is a leading opponent of fluoridation.

Ms. Pettit said John Flaherty, a Supreme Court Justice in Pennsylvania, states the evidence is quite convincing that sodium fluoride at 1 part per million is extremely detrimental to the health of the public. He took 2,800 pages of testimony before he came to that conclusion.

Mayor Hill asked how she responds to the Surgeon General's endorsement and CDC endorsements of fluoridation. Ms. Pettit said educated people seem to accept the rhetoric from the Surgeon General and CDC. Pro fluoride people aren't looking for any evidence to the contrary. He asked her if they should disregard all the data. She said yes, because there is something going on behind the scenes. Working people oppose it.

Commissioner Norwood asked if she is associating Downs Syndrome with fluoride; she said studies associate the increased incidents of Downs Syndrome births in fluoridated communities and especially in young mothers. This also applies to cancer; not all cancer is caused by fluoride, but the increase in cases of cancers in fluoridated communities is documented.

4. PUBLIC COMMENT

Jeff Jacobs, 418 Emmett Street, spoke in opposition to fluoridation, and noted Andrew Young's strong objection to fluoridation. He cited Georgia as being a 97% fluoridated state, with 61% of children with cavities among lower income and 51% of children with cavities among higher income groups. They are doing what they can to get the legislature to rescind the mandatory fluoridation law there. He provided other statistics on subpopulations that are especially vulnerable to harm by ingesting fluorides. He has deepest concern with poor families who cannot afford unfluoridated water for formula mixing. The ADA in 1986 said women with babies under 1 year old should not be using fluoridated water to mix formula. He asked if they are going to fund removal of fluoride and notify every woman with a baby under one year old that she should be using unfluoridated water for formula, and asked who is going to supply these families with unfluoridated water.

Robert Bley, 116 Sand Lake Dr., Pomona Park, distributed a letter stating the Fluoride Industry has have been efficient in convincing communities to fluoridate water by using high profile respected officials (not filed). They provide them with instructions on how to convince local governments to fluoridate water supplies. He noted 3 out of 4 fluoridation referendums fail. He noted that the WTP Superintendent has noted the chemical causes corrosion. This is commercial grade waste product; this is not what you find in toothpaste. It is a strong enough acid to eat through anything it comes in contact with. Cities with fluoridation have pipes corroded from fluoridation.

Lacy Motley, 705 St. Johns Avenue, owner, Magnolia Café, said she serves over 3,500 people per year at her café. She does not want to become a pharmacist dispensing medication through preparing meals with fluoridated water. She distributed information from countries with fluoridated water showing there is no difference in cavities in countries with fluoridated water as compared to non-fluoridated water. She also pulled up information on a study done in Portland showing two different counties, one fluoridated and one not fluoridated, and there was less tooth decay and cavities in the country that was not fluoridated. She asked why would they medicate 100% of the population over something that affects 20% of the population? If the cost for

corrosion is \$7,000 per year in repairs, the City can take that same money and put it towards prevention for dental health. If children are having issues with tooth decay, there are programs in place for that. Medicaid covers prescriptions for children in low income areas and they can get prescriptions for fluoride.

Allegra Kitchens, 1027 S. 12th Street, Palatka said in reading from Dr. Johnson' information, in the overview on infant formula, it describes the process for creating sodium fluoride, which comes from FSA. Again in Dr. Johnson's information, under a government report, there is a suggestion that incidents in bone fractures occur in higher numbers with higher levels of fluoride. Toxicity of fluoride is unresolved despite numerous studies. Their policy recommendation states the US Public Health Service should sponsor a conference to recommend levels of fluoride from all sources combined. She is 100% against adding this type of fluoride to the water.

Geri Melosh, 400 Olive Street, spoke as principal of Children's Reading Center Charter School, and said she cannot educate children when they aren't there. In looking at reasons for absences, there has been a higher incidence of kids having to go to the dentist in the past three years. She believes fluoridation decreases the level of cavities in children. Cavities cause children to miss school. They need to look to expert research in making this decision. They should listen to dentists and pediatricians. She is in support of fluoridation.

Dr. Steve Beckett said he's been practicing dentistry for 40 years. As to the elderly, they see folks who have to take a lot of medication. They have a dry mouth and need more fluoride to fight tooth decay. Oral cancer and radiation create a reduced amount of saliva which cannot wash away the things that cause tooth decay. It is proven science that fluoride prevents tooth decay; these people put fluoride in trays and put the trays in their mouths.

Kathy Jorgensen, 229 Katie Avenue, Interlachen, Putnam County School District Chairman, said the Putnam County School Board voted to approve a resolution on February 17 endorsing fluoridation in Palatka's water system, which she read aloud (filed).

5. COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Melvin Register, Palatka Water Treatment Plant Superintendent, was called to the front. Commissioner Norwood asked as to the affect of fluoride on the water system. Mr. Register said fluoride has the same effect as chlorine. The original fluoride was sodium fluoride. In the end they were using the chemical described by Ms. Pettit. It is a dangerous chemical and is a danger to employees. It breaks down their equipment. This is the industry-recommended chemical. Some people still use sodium fluoride, which is a side product of the aluminum industry. Now the phosphate industry has a glut of this other type of fluoride which they have to get rid of. Fluoride is a topical treatment; it goes on your teeth. You aren't supposed to ingest it. It accumulates in the body. One of the side effects is that it prevents your body from using Vitamin D, which allows bones to absorb calcium. It prevents your bones from using Vitamin D. Water contains naturally-produced fluoride, which is naturally flushed out through your body. This other fluoride stays in your body. Commissioner Norwood said the PH level in fluoride is very low and very toxic.

As to fluoride infusion, Mr. Register said they began re-infusing fluoride in 1997. The equipment broke down in 2004 and it wasn't used again until 2009. They stopped using it after a year due to the breakdowns it was causing in the equipment. Ceasing fluoridation was a way to save money. The American Water Works Association and Florida Rural Water Association don't have a legal or technical stance on fluoridation. They will give you the studies they have on it and allow you to make your own decision. Their studies say the greatest affect fluoride has is in children under 10. Mr. Holmes asked if there are recommendations or safeguards or procedures the employees would have to utilize if the City was to go back to fluoridating the water supply. Mr. Register said you have to use protective clothing and masks and use a neutralizer. It is in

liquid form kept in a bulk tank, pumped from a bulk tank into a day tank and then injected into the water every shift. They no longer have the equipment necessary to resume fluoridation.

6. **PUBLIC COMMENTS** on topics unrelated to Fluoridation - there were none unrelated to the Workshop Topic
7. **ADJOURN** – There being no further discussion, the workshop meeting was adjourned at 5:58 p.m. upon a motion by Commissioner Campbell.

ANY PERSON WISHING TO APPEAL ANY DECISION MADE BY THE CITY COMMISSION WITH RESPECT TO ANY MATTER CONSIDERED AT SUCH MEETING WILL NEED A RECORD OF THE PROCEEDINGS, AND FOR SUCH PURPOSE MAY NEED TO INSURE THAT A VERBATIM RECORD OF THE PROCEEDINGS IS MADE, WHICH RECORD INCLUDES THE TESTIMONY AND EVIDENCE UPON WHICH THE APPEAL IS TO BE BASED. FS 286 105

PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES REQUIRING ACCOMMODATIONS IN ORDER TO PARTICIPATE IN THIS MEETING SHOULD CONTACT THE CITY CLERK'S OFFICE AT 329-0100 AT LEAST 24 HOURS IN ADVANCE TO REQUEST ACCOMMODATIONS.