

Historic Preservation Board

May 6, 2010

Minutes & Proceedings

The Historic Board was called to order by Chairman Robbie Correa.

The following members were present: Lynda Little Crabill, Larry Beaton, Robert Goodwin and Mark Miles. The following member was absent: Vicki Mast.

Staff present: Director of Building & Zoning Debbie Banks and Recording Secretary Deena McCamey.

Approval of Minutes - Motion made by Mr. Miles to approve the April 1, 2010 minutes with second by Ms. Crabill. All those present voted affirmative, motion passed.

NEW BUSINESS

Case HB 10-10 **Address:** 516 River St
 Applicant: Pat A. Wilson

Request: For a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new storage building.

Pat Wilson, 516 River St., handed out PowerPoint packets to the Board members, showing her construction drawings of the new storage building which also included the site location. She explained to the Board her address is 516 River St. but she also owns the lot that goes all the way through to Emmett St., and this structure will be placed on the lot that faces Emmett St. she also confirmed the 2 lots are joined together in the deed of record making it 1 lot and that it is her homesteaded property.

Ms. Wilson commented that on Emmett St. there is a 6ft. wrought iron fence and on the inside there are some 60 ft. tall Leyland cypress, so none of this will be visible from the Emmett St. side and along the property line to the north there is about a 12 ft. viburnum hedge that is about 6 ft. thick.

She explained the structure will be constructed out of wood material with a metal roof and it will be painted the same color to match her existing garage and house.

Discussion- Mr. Miles stated he found it interesting that it will be built 16 ft. tall and with windows in the upper loft area.

Ms. Wilson said the windows will be for lighting.

Mr. Miles asked if she has intentions of turning the shed into future apartments.

Ms. Wilson said no there is no sewer on that property. She said it will only be used for storage. She plans on having a loft constructed inside so she can have more storage space.

Mr. Beaton asked what the total height of the building was and Ms. Wilson said probably 20-22 ft. and the pitch of the roof will be the same as her barn.

Mr. Beaton asked why she was building the shed so high.

Ms. Wilson said it is going to be used for storing some sailing masts.

Motion- made by Mr. Miles to approve. Seconded by Ms. Crabill. All those present voted affirmative.

Historic Preservation Board

May 6, 2010

Minutes & Proceedings

Case HB10-13

Address: 214 S 4th St.

Applicant: Mike and Laura Schoenberger

Request: For a Certificate of Appropriateness to apply metal roofing to the entire house and shed and to build a gazebo in the back yard.

Roofing request- Laura Schoenberger, 214 S 4th St., told the Board the house currently has 4 different types of roofing materials. She said the front has asphalt shingles, there is a flat roof with rolled tar material, her back porch has metal and the main body of the house is old asbestos composite shingles, which don't exist anymore and to get something similar looking would be cost prohibitive, this is why she's requesting a metal roof. She presented the Board photographs showing the 4 different roofs. She also commented that most of the neighbor's houses have metal roofs.

Discussion- Mr. Goodwin asked why she chose the Grand Rib 3® metal roofing material instead of the Grand Rib?

Ms. Schoenberger said she doesn't know what the differences are in the materials but her roofer showed her that style roofing material and he had pointed out other houses in the area that he had roofed with that style roofing material on them.

Motion- made by Mr. Miles to approve the metal roofing for her house and garage. Second made by Ms. Crabill. All those present voted affirmative. Motion passed.

Gazebo Request- Ms. Schoenberger told the Board her gazebo will have a wood floor and posts maybe with some lattice on the side with an arbor type roof.

Mr. Miles asked if this is going to be fabricated on site

Ms. Schoenberger said yes it will be.

Mr. Miles asked what type of wood material she planned to use.

Ms. Schoenberger stated the floor will be constructed out of pressure treated wood and she will be using the same type railings that was used on the deck (which is also pressure treated) and it will be painted white to match her house.

Mr. Miles asked if the gazebo will be directly behind the house.

Ms. Schoenberger said yes, it will be behind the house under her shade trees.

Motion- made by Ms. Crabill to approve the gazebo. Second made by Mr. Miles. All those present voted affirmative. Motion passed.

Case HB10-15

Address: 114 S 4th St.

Applicant: Diocese of St. Augustine

Agent: Eric Hopton with Hopton Roofing

Request: For a Certificate of Appropriateness to apply Medallion-Lok® metal roofing material to the Parish Hall and Rectory Buildings.

Historic Preservation Board

May 6, 2010

Minutes & Proceedings

Case HB10-15 114 S 4th St. continued

Eric Hopton, Lake Helen FL, handed out packets showing the Parish Hall and the Rectory Building. He told the Board he is proposing to install the Standing Seam Rib Panel System® on the two buildings. The main church already has the Standing Seam roof on it which is white, so everything will match after completion. He showed the Board a picture of the Rectory Building which has the original Standing Seam roofing material on it. He also said Standing Seam is one of the older types of metals that are on roofs.

Discussion- Ms. Correa asked if the second story of the Rectory building is a stamped tin design.

Mr. Hopton said yes, it is, but it is extremely expensive. He also said the Church wants to match the design of the main church. The Church Hall has the shingle material on it now, but they want to put the Standing Seam roof on it to match the other buildings.

Mr. Goodwin asked the width of the panels they are going to be use.

Mr. Hopton replied 16 inches.

Mr. Miles stated he generally likes the idea of consolidating the buildings and getting the similar roofing material on all of them, however, in this case, the Rectory Building is substantially different in architecture, style and age.

Motion- made by Ms. Crabill to approve the re-roof. Second made by Mr. Beaton. All those present voted affirmative. Motion passed.

Other Business- Paint Color Chart and roofing material workshop.

Ms. Banks told the Board that in November 2009 they had a discussion about the paint colors and the City Attorney at that time had cautioned the Board about changing the regulations. She read the minutes from the November 5, 2009 meeting stating “she said she had spoken with Don Holmes about what the City could do with the Historic District Ordinance and he said the ordinance should not have any major change because it ties into Tallahassee and the State’s rules for Historic Districts. If the Board chooses to request changes such as making the paint more restrictive or something like that, Mr. Holmes said the Board must state the authority setting forth any changes.” She said she’s not so sure they can make it more restrictive. She said she would have to call Tallahassee to see what other steps the Board will need to do.

Mr. Miles told Ms. Banks it has been demonstrated in other places that it can be done.

Ms. Banks said she didn’t know what steps the other places took.

Mr. Miles said he didn’t mind tabling this workshop until Ms. Banks was able to get in touch with Tallahassee and the instructions were received. He also said he is confident it can be done.

Ms. Banks said before she makes the call she needs to know exactly what the Board’s thoughts are on making the paint pallets more restrictive. I.e. saying you can only paint from a certain paint chart or is the Board looking at what combinations of paint colors can be used and what are the Board’s thoughts on how this should be forwarded.

Historic Preservation Board

May 6, 2010

Minutes & Proceedings

Paint Color Chart and roofing material workshop continued

Mr. Miles said his thought was the Historic District would have a standardized paint chart with primary colors, secondary colors and accent colors where they can be garnered from historic paint colors from various manufacturers. Then if the homeowner wishes to come off of that chart they would have to come before the Board for approval, but staff level of approval can be garnered from that approved chart.

Ms. Correa said she doesn't agree with the whole theory from the historic standpoint and asked what the basis for deciding these colors was. She showed an example of outdoor color paints from 1914 and the colors are very vibrant and bright. She asked how does the Board determine what is appropriate. There are a lot of houses here from that era, but there are other houses that are a lot older, how does the Board tell the people what is right or wrong and how does the Board suddenly become the expert. She said let's wait and see what Tallahassee has to say. She suggested the Board needs to be really careful when becoming restrictive and that she would rather do a bull's eye test of different sections of their house to get to the base color to establish what the color was to begin with if the Board is going to be that restrictive.

Ms. Banks asked if they are not saying what era the house would have been constructed, but to figure out what colors were available in that era and not talking about being that restrictive. She said she needs to be sure what she is asking the State.

Mr. Miles said he would love to do an era chart.

Ms. Correa said she would rather have an era chart than to have a chart with historic colors the Board chose.

Mr. Miles said the Board can do both, there can be a Board choice chart or an era chart for the period which is described in many manufacturer charts.

Ms. Crabill said it might help those people who have a hard time choosing color combinations.

Mr. Miles said Sherwin Williams is a very good example because they have 5 different historic color charts from 5 different eras. He said he didn't think the Board was ready to go that far, but he is, to have separate era base charts would be wonderful.

Ms. Crabill said the Board should not be restricted only to the era charts, giving the homeowner the knowledge.

Ms. Banks told the Board that staff has the homeowner bring in the historic color chart showing the color they intend to paint.

Mr. Miles said most of the historic color charts are not separated by exterior or interior colors.

Ms. Banks said when she calls the State she is going to ask if the Board can be more restrictive and is there a point where they can restrict it by era or pick certain colors that the Board thinks are good colors for the body, trim and accent. She said she will report back next month on her findings.

Brandon Leach, representing the Sherwin Williams® paint company, said he had worked with the City of St. Augustine's historic District in the past and what they chose was to go by era, then they

Historic Preservation Board

May 6, 2010

Minutes & Proceedings

Paint Color Chart and roofing material workshop continued

have it by acceptable colors and if the homeowner wishes to come off those charts they need to go in front of their Board for approval.

Mr. Leach stated he has made color charts for them, and that the City of St. Augustine has a black and white handout that has multiple color numbers and shades from multiple manufacturers for the homeowner to choose from.

Mr. Miles asked if the City chooses to have Mr. Leach put some sample color charts together when should he be advised to move forward?

Ms. Banks said after she calls the State and gets their response and how complicated it may be - it may be too preliminary for Mr. Leach to move forward. He can come back next month for an update.

Mr. Miles said that if Mr. Holmes is going to continue to have some issues with the color chart he would like to invite him to talk to some of the other municipal legal representatives that have already fought the battle and won the wars because this has been done and the wheel will not need to be reinvented.

Mr. Goodwin asked Mr. Leach where does Sherwin Williams® select what is historic and what are their criteria.

Mr. Leach said the criteria usually is defined by predating and going back to the original colors that were on the building's they have chosen eras for exterior and interior. He also stated the company goes back 140 years so they have their colors predated and able to go back far enough for eras.

Other Business- Ms. Banks told the Board that Ms. Braddy is tendering her resignation, so the Board will have an alternate position open as well as the attorney position.

Ms. Correa said that when positions open for the Board she intends to let both of the neighborhood associations know in case a resident in the districts would like to volunteer.

Motion- to adjourn made by Mr. Miles. Second made by Mr. Goodwin. All those present voted affirmative. Motion passed.

Meeting adjourned at 4:55pm.